

Minutes from working group 3 meeting in Trondheim 2004.04.16-18

Participants:

Kerstin Westerlund Sweden Chairman
Alberto Dusman Italy
Helene Hanes Sweden
Steve Emery English Heritage UK
Peter Hristov
Einar Karlsen National Board of Antiquities Riksantikvarien Norway
Mariana Llinares Spain
Ingval Maxwell UK
Galina Mileva Bulgaria
Kalle Reivila National Board of Antiquities Finland
Simon Singer Main de Paris France
Louis Vega Catalan
Dietmar Wohltan Austria

Agenda

Activity list dated 2004.04.04 was decided to be used as agenda.

1) Papers spread to the working group before the meeting were checked up and discussed

3.1 Cultural value

1. **Re-state the importance of historic and cultural “authenticity” and significance, in particular the importance that historic buildings may have for the community and society.**
 - a) *Give an overview over the contents of the most important of the international conservation charters, statements of Significance etc*
 - b) *Summarise implications, importance and interpretations of international conservation charters to assist in their interpretation and use by Fire Engineering and Brigade colleagues*
 - c) *Link from Cost 17 home page*

Maire Mattinen has written a) and has promised to complete it with b) and c)

2. **Give a definition of cultural historic value**
 - a) *Define what You in Your country mean with historic value*

We have definitions from UK, Spain Sweden, Finland, Norway. Some sort of summary is of value. **Kerstin W** will look at the possibility to do that

3. **Given loss of authentic fabric because of fire, consider principles of deciding what should be built in its place – a recreation of what was there before, or a modern replacement.**
 - a) *Describe the principles for deciding what should be built in its place considering value and degree of loss. Consider different types of authenticity*

Kerstin W will do some changes, to strengthen the traditional material aspect

b) *Study and summarise English Heritage report about decision making with reference to Brighton West Pier*

Steve Emery gave the report to Kerstin W. Who will try to summarise it.

c) Extract information in terms of case studies from the Nordic project "Can we learn from the heritage lost in fire"

The report was distributed to all the cost 17 participants. **Kerstin W** will ask the publishers for the text and add relevant parts to the wg 3 material. **Kalle R** will arrange a link to the cost 17 home page. www.raa.se/byggnadsvard/brandskydd.asp

d) Prepare summaries of case studies from United Kingdom, Switzerland etc

Steve E has contributed with Uppark House The decision to restore to be included in the wg 3 material

e) Prepare summaries of case studies of examples of hypothetical decisions of how to act after a fire:

We have an Example from Sweden. **Dietman Wohltan** will give short information from Schönbrunn.

f) Describe examples of documentation to make reconstruction possible

We have an example from Sweden

g) Research projects after fire Tyrvää Church Finland

h) Gather press cuttings in relation to current debates on recreation vs. modern replacement for sites destroyed by fire

All countries

j) Gather press cuttings in relation to current debates on security for cultural heritage property
All countries

3.2 Cultural value and economy

1. Discuss what historic value means to economy and the costs of losing historic valuable property because of fire

a) Describe different aspects of price of the value or costs for the value

The existing paper was discussed and will be completed by **Kerstin W**

b) Describe impacts from historic value on national economy (regional development, the power of attraction as settlement, for enterprise, the need for tourist industry etc)

Kerstin W

The existing paper was discussed and will be completed by **Kerstin W**

2. Describe various attempts to estimate the economic value of historic buildings on the national or regional level

a) Provide cost 17 with figures and statistics from Norwegian/European project

Sjur Helseth has promised to send the papers to Kerstin. It will be included in the material

a) Provide cost 17 with summary from "Heritage counts"

Steve E

c) Provide cost 17 with summary from "Agenda Cultural Heritage" ??

Kerstin W

d) Provide cost 17 with summary from "Wooden towns" ???

3. Give examples of costs for reconstruction after a fire ?

All countries

Kalle R has contributed with the costs for reconstruction of Tyrvää Church

Kerstin will try to find some information about Katharina church. There has to be more examples

2) New issues to be discussed in the working group

3.3 Insurance of historical buildings, financial data

1. Create contact with insurance Companies and

- a) Describe the principles behind insurance companies work with historic buildings*
- b) Describe models to estimate the insurance fee in historic buildings*
- c) Identify relevant key questions and discuss them with representatives for insurance companies and with property owners. Discuss these with insurance companies*

Today insurance is available for churches in Finland, Norway, UK, Switzerland and Sweden. State-owned property is usually not insured. An advantage is Sweden who has a special sort of insurance for state owned property.

Steve E told about Colbin Trust which is specialised on historic property. Kerstin told about the situation in Sweden. We have preliminary papers from Sweden and Finland.

The participants were asked to create contact with insurance companies for making them aware about the problems with historic buildings. It is necessary to effect understanding and change. Insurance companies have a lack of interest and insufficient data to calculate the extent of the real heritage that is at risk, actually to calculate the cost of the value of the heritage.

3) Next working group meeting

It was decided to be a need for a special working group meeting about matters related to insurance, risk analysis and the ethical aspect of loss recovery. A suitable date would be 09-10th of June 2004

Kerstin Westerlund

Copy to the non participating